

# Agenda Item 6

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE  
21<sup>st</sup> August 2014

<u>UPRN</u>	<u>APPLICATION NO.</u>	<u>Item No:</u> <u>DATE VALID</u>
	14/P0738	03/03/2014
<b>Address/Site</b>	67 Murray Road, Wimbledon, London, SW19 4PF	
<b>Ward</b>	Village	
<b>Proposal:</b>	Erection of a single storey rear extension, excavation of basement and alteration to the roof pitch.	
<b>Drawing Nos</b>	Existing plans- P96_MSSP_01, P96_MS_01, P96_MS_02, P96_MS_03, P96_MS_04, P96_MS_05, P96_MS_06, P96_MS_07, P96_MS_08, Site Location plan – P96_LP_01, Proposed Plans - P96_GASP_0.01 Rev A, P96_GA_0.00 Rev A, 0.01.Rev A, 0.02.B, 0.03, 0.04, 0.05, 006, 0.07, 008, 00.9 and Design and Access Statement, Tree Survey Assessment, Construction Method Statement Rev1 dated 24/06/14	
<b>Contact Officer:</b>	Stuart Adams (0208 545 3147)	

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

**GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions.**

## **CHECKLIST INFORMATION.**

Heads of agreement: - N/A

Is a screening opinion required: No

Is an Environmental Statement required: No

Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted – No

Press notice – No

Site notice – Yes

Design Review Panel consulted – No

Number of neighbours consulted – 3

External consultations – No.

PTAL score – 2

1. **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 The application has been brought before the Planning Applications Committee for consideration because of the number of objections.

2. **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

- 2.1 The application site comprises a two storey detached house in Murray Road, Wimbledon. The road is characterised by large detached houses.
- 2.2 It is locally listed and falls within the Wimbledon West Conservation Area.

3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 The proposal is for the erection of a single storey rear extension, provision of a basement and alterations to the roof pitch.
- 3.2 The proposed single storey rear extension would have a modern appearance, with glass the predominant material. It would have a depth of 2.8m, width of 9.5m and flat roof height of 3.2m.
- 3.3 The proposed basement would be sited predominantly beneath the original house and single storey rear extension with the exception of the front light well, small sunken terrace to the side and 3.6m additional projection into the rear garden area. The rear basement area would be lit by a glass rooflight flush with the ground level.
- 3.4 The basement contains a plant room, utility room, wine cellar, media room, library, gym/office, sauna, storage and spare bedroom with kitchenette and bathroom.
- 3.4 The proposed alteration to the roof pitch of the original dwellinghouse would involve bring part of the existing roof forward to create a new flat roof section between the existing twin pitched roof features of the main roof. The existing tiles would be retained and reused on the new roof pitch to match the existing roofs.

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

4.1 92/P0481 - Erection of dormer window on north west elevation – Grant - 28/08/1992

## 5. CONSULTATION

5.1 The application has been advertised by conservation area site and press notice procedure and letters of notification to the occupiers of neighbouring properties.

5.1.1 In response to the consultation, 10 letters of objection were received (including one from Murray Road (North) Residents' Association and one from the Wimbledon Society). The letters of objection raise the following points:

- Permanent stream on this side of street. Are dealing with this with pumps in the cellar, flooding of existing cellars
- Too many applications for underground extensions to existing houses which interfere with water courses and water levels, will cause drainage problems for adjacent houses and gardens,
- Impact upon trees (altered ground water levels)
- Basement far too big and will cause structural problems
- Extensive works will lose the character of this arts and craft house
- Increased massing of an already sizeable house which, cumulatively, along with others, will adversely affect the Conservation Area), undesirable precedent
- Modern rear extension is out of keeping
- Disruption during works

### 5.1.2 Murray Road (North) Residents Association

- Enormous basement and huge displacement of earth and interference with water courses, drainage affecting both properties and gardens with mature trees requiring a balanced water supply
- New basement policy to deal with precisely these type of concerns in the light of similar applications
- Request that proposal does not involve excavations simultaneous with others
- Disruption during construction, noise, parking and construction activity for many months

### 5.1.3 The Wimbledon Society

- Valued and unique arts and crafts characteristics. Comprehensive changes would compromise its structure and character.
- Merton's policy DMD2 (B)iii specifically states that excavation of

basements under listed buildings is to be opposed (note: the building is not statutorily listed)

- Basement should be accompanied by a detailed study of the method of removal of spoil and protection of neighbouring properties and amenities.

## 6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

### 6.1 **Adopted Core Planning Strategy (July 2011)**

CS14 - Design

CS20 - Parking, Servicing and Delivery

### 6.2 **Adopted Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014)**

DM D2 (Design Considerations in all developments)

DM D3 (Alterations and extensions to existing buildings)

DM D4 (Managing heritage assets).

## 7. **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

7.1 The principal planning considerations relates to the design of the proposed extensions and impact upon the locally listed building, the Murray Road street scene, West Wimbledon Conservation Area and trees, neighbouring amenity and concerns related to the proposed basement (drainage, flooding and structural integrity of adjoining buildings).

### 7.2 **Amendments**

7.2.1 One of the front light wells (right hand side) has been removed from the scheme due to concerns regarding its proximity to the root protection area of the adjacent tree within the front curtilage.

### 7.3 **Impact upon the Locally Listed Building, Murray Road Street Scene and the West Wimbledon Conservation Area**

7.3.1 67 Murray Road is a locally listed building, and as such is an undesignated Heritage Asset within the West Wimbledon Conservation Area and a valued component of the historic environment. It dates from 1909 and is designed in an Arts and Craft style. The most notable features of interest include the brick detail to the chimneys to the gable and the semi-circular arches over the two first floor front windows, the porch design with its supporting pillars and leaded glass and the eaves detailing.

7.3.2 The proposed single storey rear extension would be a small flat roofed predominantly glazed addition. Whilst it is noted that its design would not

- match the arts and crafts design of the original dwellinghouse, the Conservation Officer has not raised any objections to this approach. The extension would have a lightweight appearance with its glass walls and roof, is modest in size and located at ground floor level to the rear of the property and therefore not visible from the public realm. It should be noted that if it were not part of a wider proposal, the rear extension would fall within permitted development .
- 7.3.3 The proposed new section of flat roof between the properties existing twin pitched roof features would not be clearly evident from street level due to the set back position from the frontage at roof level and its siting between the existing twin gable roof forms. Due to its lack of visibility from street level, the proposed new flat roof section is not considered to have an unacceptable impact upon the character and appearance of the original building.
- 7.3.4 The only element of the proposed basement visible from the public realm would be the proposed front light well, which at 1m in depth and between 1.1 and 2.1m in width, is modest in size and would be covered with a flush grille. The proposed sunken terrace to the side of the property is set 8.6m back from the road frontage and 4m back from the front wall, and would be set behind gates to the side of the property. An additional front light well has been removed to avoid any adverse impact on the adjacent tree and the Council's tree officer has confirmed that there are no trees with public amenity value that would be affected by the excavation of the land.
- 7.3.5 One of the objections refers to part b) of planning policy DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments) of the Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014) which precludes basements under listed buildings. Members are advised that the definition of listed building for the interpretation of planning policy DM D2 has been confirmed by the Council's Planning Policy section to refer to Statutorily Listed Buildings only, not locally listed buildings, so there is no conflict with policy DM D2 in this respect. The impact on general structural stability is dealt with in more detail later in the report.
- 7.3.6 In summary, the works that would be visible above ground and from the public realm are limited to the grille of the front lightwell. None of the key external design features of the locally listed building are affected. Although an additional floor level is being added below ground, the impact on the visible mass of the building is negligible. It is therefore considered that the impact of the proposal on the character and appearance of the West Wimbledon Conservation area, the Murray Road streetscene and the locally listed building is acceptable and accords with Policy DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets), policy DM D2 parts a) and b) (Design Considerations in all Developments).

#### 7.4 **Impact on Neighbour amenity/Basement Impact**

7.4.1 Given the modest nature of the above ground elements of the proposal, they are not considered to have an adverse impact on the amenities of neighbouring properties. The main source of concern and objection is the impact of the basement in terms of ground stability, hydrology and impact of construction works. Policy DM D2 (c) requires an assessment of impacts of basement and subterranean schemes on structural stability, groundwater conditions and flooding from all sources and drainage.

7.4.2 The applicant has commissioned an independent structural engineer (Green Structural Engineering) to produce a Construction Method Statement which provides a detailed assessment for the preparation and construction of the basement. The report advises the following:

##### 7.4.3 **Geology and Hydrology Conditions**

The British Geological Survey website indicates the ground conditions to be Black Park Gravels overlying London Clay. A site specific borehole has been conducted determining the strata to be Black Park Gravels from 1.6-4.7 meters followed by London clay beneath as expected. Water was encountered at a depth of 2.90 meters, thus adequate sumps and pumps will need to be designed for. Monitoring of ground water levels is recommended before the construction stage as well as a de-watering system designed for the construction phase. Heave will need to be designed and accounted for in the permanent works design. Furthermore to heave forces, the permanent works design will account for upwards forces caused by the ground water table.

7.4.4 The site lies outside the floodplain of the River Thames and more than 100 meters away from surface water and Lost Rivers. The Environmental Agency flood maps show no risk of flooding due to rivers or reservoirs etc to the area. The site is within the 1000 year flood return zone.

7.4.5 The new foundations will be designed for the ground conditions encountered and be formed in the gravel formation. The existing geology at the depth of the proposed lowered floor level will be capable of supporting the new imposed loads.

##### 7.4.6 **Potential Impact on Structural stability**

Proposed construction sequencing is set out in the method statement. The proposed basement under the existing property will be formed using an underpinning method, reducing the amount of potential ground movement and minimising the effects of settlement of the adjacent structures. Expected settlement is minimal provided an experienced contractor is appointed who undertakes the works using good practice in accordance with the structural design and follows all agreed method statements. .

#### 7.4.7 Slope Stability

The site is located on ground that is relatively flat and so geological slope instability is not an issue. The only issue of ground stability is in the temporary condition as the proposed underpins are being constructed when the risk is associated with a local collapse of a partially formed underpinning. If the methods and temporary support outlined in the report are used this is highly unlikely. All temporary propping will be designed for the loading present.

#### 7.4.8 Potential impact on drainage, sewage, surface and ground water levels and flows including suds

All existing drainage and sewage connections will be maintained throughout the construction works so there will be no impact on these existing systems. The proposed development will not alter the current state of the property, which will remain as part of a single residence; therefore there will be no significant change in discharge to the existing drainage and sewage systems and there will be little or no impact on the foul drainage.

7.4.9 Surface water will not be greatly altered as the proposed drawings show that the current ratio of flower beds and hard surfacing will be maintained and therefore no loss of infiltration to the underlying aquifer is expected. The proposed basement is not expected to have any effect on the hydrology of the site.

7.4.10 The new basement will be constructed within the relatively permeable Black Park Gravel Member and therefore, it is considered unlikely that the new basement will create a significant 'cut off' obstruction to groundwater flow beneath the site. The new basement is therefore expected to have a relatively limited effect on the hydrological flows below this site and the adjacent properties. As a cut off to the ground flow will not occur due to the ground water being able to flow around and underneath the proposed basement, any damming effect will be negligible and any effect on the hydrological flows would be negligible.

#### 7.4.11 Basement Conclusion

An assessment of potential impact on hydrology and structural stability has been submitted in accordance with Policy DM D2 9 (c). A condition will be imposed requiring adherence to the construction method statement. It should be noted that the structural stability of adjacent properties may be properly dealt with by means of a party wall agreement under the Party Wall Act 1996. A construction management plan will be required prior to commencement of works in relation to deliveries to and from site and control of dust etc.

#### 7.5 **Archaeology**

The application site is located within an Archaeological Zone as identified on the policies map. A planning condition would therefore be imposed to secure a programme of archaeological investigation.

#### 7.6 **Parking and Traffic**

7.6.1 The site has a PTAL rating of 2 and is located within CPZ- VO's. Suitable parking provision is retained within the front curtilage for the enlarged house.

#### 7.7 **Local Financial Considerations**

7.7.1 The proposed development is liable to pay the Mayoral Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL), the funds for which will be applied by the Mayor towards the Crossrail project and Merton's CIL. The CIL amount is non-negotiable.

### 8. **SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS**

8.1.1 The proposal is for minor householder development and an Environmental Impact Assessment is not required in this instance.

8.1.2 The application does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly, there are no requirements in terms of EIA submission.

### 9. **CONCLUSION**

9.1.1 The proposed extensions and alterations would respect the original dwelling, would preserve the character and appearance of the Wimbledon West Conservation Area and would have no undue impact upon trees or neighbouring amenity. The proposal is in accordance with Adopted Unitary Development Plan, Core Planning Strategy and London Plan policies. The

proposal is therefore recommended for approval subject to conditions.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION subject to the following conditions:

1. A1        Commencement of Development (full application)
2. A7        Approved Plans
3. B3        Materials as Specified
4.            No Use of Flat Roof
5.            F4 – Tree Survey Approved
6.            F5P – Tree Protection
7.            Design and Construction of Foundation; No work shall be commenced until details of the proposed method of excavation and construction of the basement to be constructed within 8.4 metres radius of the Cedar tree shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the LPA and the work shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. Such details shall have regard to the BS 5837:2012 and shall also form part of the Arboricultural Method Statement and Tree Protection Plan.  
  
Reason; To protect and safeguard the existing Cedar tree located in the neighbouring garden in accordance with policy CS13 of the AMCPS 2011;
8.            F8 – Site Supervision
9.            Replacement trees: No development shall take place until there has been submitted in writing for approval to the LPA details of the size, native species, and location for 2 replacement trees. The planting shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. The planting shall be carried out at the conclusion of site works or within the first available planting season, whichever is the sooner, If either tree within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development dies, is removed or becomes seriously damage or diseased or is dying shall be replaced in the next planting season with another tree of the same specification, unless the LPA gives written consent to any variation.

Reason: To enhance the appearance of the development in the interest of the amenities of the area and to comply with policy CS13 of the AMCPS 2011.

- 10 Implementation in accordance with construction method statement
- 11 Construction Hours
- 12 Construction Management Plan